San Francisco Health Service System Health Service Board

City Plan (UHC) Utilization and Claims Experience Calendar Year 2016 Presentation

February 9, 2017



Prepared by: Aon | Aon Hewitt | Health & Benefits

Contents

Summary

- Introduction
- City Plan (UHC)—Claims Experience
 - Active
 - Early Retiree
 - Medicare
- Conclusion



Summary

This presentation will outline the following for the City Plan which is administered by UnitedHealthcare (UHC):

- The 2016 experience by employee / retiree status (Active Employees, Early Retiree, Medicare Retiree)
- Observations for 2016 versus 2015 are as follows:
 - Contract Size
 - Average incurred cost per subscriber by subscriber group (Active Employees, Early Retiree, Medicare Retiree)
 - Average paid cost per subscriber by subscriber group (Active Employees, Early Retiree, Medicare Retiree)
 - Membership by subscriber group (Active Employees, Early Retiree, Medicare Retiree)



Introduction

In an effort to bring about long term sustainability of City Plan, in 2016 the Health Service Board (HSB) chose to subsidize the active and early retiree rates for the 2016 plan year by a total of \$13,991,000 to reduce overall rates and corresponding member contributions.

The HSB, at the June 21, 2016 meeting, chose to add additional stabilization funds to the Plan year 2017 active and early member rates to continue stabilization of the City Plan.

Additionally, beginning in the 2017 plan year, the HSB eliminated the self-funded Medicare City Plan and replaced it with a fully-insured Medicare Advantage PPO plan which transferred the risk to UHC and allowed HSS to negotiate lower rates and a two year rate cap.



City Plan (UHC)—Active Claims Experience

| | | | | | | Average | | | | | | Paid | | Incurred |
|---------------------|-----|--------|--------|-------------|------------|----------|----------|------------|------------|-------------|--------------|-------|--------------|----------|
| | | | | Total | | Contract | EE | EE + 1 | EE + 2 | Monthly | Paid | Loss | Incurred | Loss |
| Month | EE | EE + 1 | EE + 2 | Subscribers | Dependents | Size | Rate | Rate | Rate | Premium | Claims | Ratio | Claims | Ratio |
| Jan-16 | 554 | 109 | 72 | 735 | 326 | 1.44 | \$756.67 | \$1,484.92 | \$2,105.87 | \$732,674 | \$1,033,390 | 141% | \$1,165,547 | 159% |
| Feb-16 | 563 | 117 | 74 | 754 | 345 | 1.46 | \$756.67 | \$1,484.92 | \$2,105.87 | \$755,575 | \$1,212,067 | 160% | \$1,127,853 | 149% |
| Mar-16 | 567 | 118 | 76 | 761 | 351 | 1.46 | \$756.67 | \$1,484.92 | \$2,105.87 | \$764,299 | \$1,389,846 | 182% | \$879,398 | 115% |
| Apr-16 | 576 | 122 | 80 | 778 | 368 | 1.47 | \$756.67 | \$1,484.92 | \$2,105.87 | \$785,472 | \$1,115,684 | 142% | \$802,717 | 102% |
| May-16 | 585 | 120 | 87 | 792 | 385 | 1.49 | \$756.67 | \$1,484.92 | \$2,105.87 | \$804,053 | \$768,112 | 96% | \$1,195,439 | 149% |
| Jun-16 | 588 | 124 | 91 | 803 | 405 | 1.50 | \$756.67 | \$1,484.92 | \$2,105.87 | \$820,686 | \$944,232 | 115% | \$930,609 | 113% |
| Jul-16 | 594 | 123 | 91 | 808 | 401 | 1.50 | \$756.67 | \$1,484.92 | \$2,105.87 | \$823,741 | \$1,039,035 | 126% | \$1,211,654 | 147% |
| Aug-16 | 601 | 125 | 93 | 819 | 414 | 1.51 | \$756.67 | \$1,484.92 | \$2,105.87 | \$836,220 | \$853,856 | 102% | \$1,058,057 | 127% |
| Sep-16 | 616 | 130 | 105 | 851 | 452 | 1.53 | \$756.67 | \$1,484.92 | \$2,105.87 | \$880,265 | \$864,789 | 98% | \$942,248 | 107% |
| Oct-16 | 620 | 136 | 109 | 865 | 466 | 1.54 | \$756.67 | \$1,484.92 | \$2,105.87 | \$900,624 | \$1,283,676 | 143% | \$1,050,671 | 117% |
| Nov-16 | 627 | 138 | 113 | 878 | 478 | 1.54 | \$756.67 | \$1,484.92 | \$2,105.87 | \$917,314 | \$1,126,299 | 123% | \$1,122,878 | 122% |
| Dec-16 | 634 | 142 | 115 | 891 | 486 | 1.55 | \$756.67 | \$1,484.92 | \$2,105.87 | \$932,762 | \$1,065,220 | 114% | \$1,229,120 | 132% |
| Totals / Averages | | | | 811 | | | | | | \$9,953,686 | \$12,696,206 | 128% | \$12,716,190 | 128% |
| Surplus / (Deficit) | | | | | | | | | | | -\$2,742,520 | | -\$2,762,504 | |



City Plan (UHC)—Active Claims Experience

Observations

- Contract size has increased since it hit a historical low in December 2014:
 - December 2014: 1.24
 - December 2015: 1.31
 - December 2016: 1.55
- Average incurred cost per subscriber decreased:
 - 2016: \$1,306 vs. average premium of \$1,022 = incurred loss ratio of <u>128%</u>
 - 2015: \$1,486 vs. average premium of \$1,232 = incurred loss ratio of <u>121%</u>



City Plan (UHC)—Active Claims Experience

Observations (continued)

- Average paid cost per subscriber decreased:
 - 2016: \$1,304 vs. average premium of \$1,022 = paid loss ratio of <u>128%</u>
 - 2015: \$1,482 vs. average premium of \$1,232 = paid loss ratio of <u>119%</u>
- Membership increased:
 - December 2016: 891
 - December 2015: 612



City Plan (UHC)—Early Retiree Claims Experience

| | | | | | | Average | | | | | | Paid | | Incurred |
|-------------------|----------|--------|--------|-------------|------------|----------|----------|------------|------------|--------------|--------------|-------|--------------|----------|
| | | | | Total | | Contract | EE | EE + 1 | EE + 2 | Monthly | Paid | Loss | Incurred | Loss |
| Month | EE | EE + 1 | EE + 2 | Subscribers | Dependents | Size | Rate | Rate | Rate | Premium | Claims | Ratio | Claims | Ratio |
| Jan-16 | 617 | 173 | 10 | 800 | 293 | 1.37 | \$934.45 | \$1,838.78 | \$2,459.73 | \$919,262 | \$782,434 | 85% | \$912,790 | 99% |
| Feb-16 | 607 | 169 | 10 | 786 | 290 | 1.37 | \$934.45 | \$1,838.78 | \$2,459.73 | \$902,562 | \$970,328 | 108% | \$1,055,344 | 117% |
| Mar-16 | 607 | 161 | 10 | 778 | 287 | 1.37 | \$934.45 | \$1,838.78 | \$2,459.73 | \$887,852 | \$1,237,021 | 139% | \$1,755,099 | 198% |
| Apr-16 | 589 | 157 | 11 | 757 | 289 | 1.38 | \$934.45 | \$1,838.78 | \$2,459.73 | \$866,137 | \$1,792,309 | 207% | \$1,368,360 | 158% |
| May-16 | 564 | 148 | 13 | 725 | 291 | 1.40 | \$934.45 | \$1,838.78 | \$2,459.73 | \$831,146 | \$1,141,045 | 137% | \$1,754,728 | 211% |
| Jun-16 | 557 | 145 | 13 | 715 | 292 | 1.41 | \$934.45 | \$1,838.78 | \$2,459.73 | \$819,088 | \$1,504,088 | 184% | \$1,599,382 | 195% |
| Jul-16 | 553 | 153 | 14 | 720 | 304 | 1.42 | \$934.45 | \$1,838.78 | \$2,459.73 | \$832,520 | \$1,641,520 | 197% | \$1,737,711 | 209% |
| Aug-16 | 543 | 153 | 16 | 712 | 310 | 1.44 | \$934.45 | \$1,838.78 | \$2,459.73 | \$828,095 | \$1,668,433 | 201% | \$1,432,319 | 173% |
| Sep-16 | 541 | 149 | 17 | 707 | 309 | 1.44 | \$934.45 | \$1,838.78 | \$2,459.73 | \$821,331 | \$1,432,052 | 174% | \$1,076,432 | 131% |
| Oct-16 | 527 | 146 | 18 | 691 | 311 | 1.45 | \$934.45 | \$1,838.78 | \$2,459.73 | \$805,192 | \$1,177,184 | 146% | \$1,385,570 | 172% |
| Nov-16 | 526 | 142 | 19 | 687 | 315 | 1.46 | \$934.45 | \$1,838.78 | \$2,459.73 | \$799,362 | \$1,373,043 | 172% | \$1,319,771 | 165% |
| Dec-16 | 533 | 144 | 21 | 698 | 324 | 1.46 | \$934.45 | \$1,838.78 | \$2,459.73 | \$814,501 | \$1,532,670 | 188% | \$1,450,190 | 178% |
| Totals / Averages | | | | 731 | | | | | | \$10,127,049 | \$16,252,127 | 160% | \$16,847,697 | 166% |
| Surplus | / (Defic | :it) | | | | | | | | | -\$6,125,078 | | -\$6,720,649 | |



City Plan (UHC)—Early Retiree Claims Experience

Observations

- Contract size has decreased slightly:
 - December 2016: 1.46
 - December 2015: 1.49
- Average incurred cost per subscriber decreased:
 - 2016: \$1,920 vs. average premium of \$1,154 = incurred loss ratio of <u>166%</u>
 - 2015: \$2,196 vs. average premium of \$1,468 = incurred loss ratio of <u>150%</u>



City Plan (UHC)—Early Retiree Claims Experience

Observations (continued)

- Average paid cost per subscriber decreased:
 - 2016: \$1,852 vs. average premium of \$1,154 = paid loss ratio of <u>160%</u>
 - 2015: \$2,321 vs. average premium of \$1,468 = paid loss ratio of <u>158%</u>
- The membership increased:
 - December 2016: 698
 - December 2015: 547



City Plan (UHC)—Medicare Claims Experience

| | | | | | | Average | | | | | | Paid | | Incurred |
|-------------------|------------|--------|--------|-------------|------------|----------|----------|----------|------------|--------------|--------------|-------|--------------|----------|
| | | | | Total | | Contract | EE | EE + 1 | EE + 2 | Monthly | Paid | Loss | Incurred | Loss |
| Month | EE | EE + 1 | EE + 2 | Subscribers | Dependents | Size | Rate | Rate | Rate | Premium | Claims | Ratio | Claims | Ratio |
| Jan-16 | 3,732 | 1,181 | 16 | 4,929 | 1,127 | 1.23 | \$280.66 | \$534.74 | \$1,155.69 | \$1,697,442 | \$1,690,464 | 100% | \$1,855,106 | 109% |
| Feb-16 | 3,735 | 1,178 | 16 | 4,929 | 1,123 | 1.23 | \$280.66 | \$534.74 | \$1,155.69 | \$1,696,680 | \$1,908,840 | 113% | \$1,891,093 | 111% |
| Mar-16 | 3,741 | 1,176 | 16 | 4,933 | 1,116 | 1.23 | \$280.66 | \$534.74 | \$1,155.69 | \$1,697,294 | \$1,904,182 | 112% | \$1,952,355 | 115% |
| Apr-16 | 3,751 | 1,176 | 16 | 4,943 | 1,112 | 1.22 | \$280.66 | \$534.74 | \$1,155.69 | \$1,700,101 | \$1,983,058 | 117% | \$1,912,516 | 112% |
| May-16 | 3,763 | 1,178 | 16 | 4,957 | 1,109 | 1.22 | \$280.66 | \$534.74 | \$1,155.69 | \$1,704,538 | \$1,967,560 | 115% | \$1,906,231 | 112% |
| Jun-16 | 3,768 | 1,179 | 16 | 4,963 | 1,105 | 1.22 | \$280.66 | \$534.74 | \$1,155.69 | \$1,706,476 | \$1,939,584 | 114% | \$1,914,519 | 112% |
| Jul-16 | 3,780 | 1,177 | 17 | 4,974 | 1,106 | 1.22 | \$280.66 | \$534.74 | \$1,155.69 | \$1,709,931 | \$2,006,318 | 117% | \$1,881,352 | 110% |
| Aug-16 | 3,778 | 1,176 | 17 | 4,971 | 1,104 | 1.22 | \$280.66 | \$534.74 | \$1,155.69 | \$1,708,834 | \$1,854,149 | 109% | \$1,994,350 | 117% |
| Sep-16 | 3,776 | 1,173 | 18 | 4,967 | 1,102 | 1.22 | \$280.66 | \$534.74 | \$1,155.69 | \$1,707,825 | \$1,955,317 | 114% | \$1,930,420 | 113% |
| Oct-16 | 3,782 | 1,174 | 17 | 4,973 | 1,099 | 1.22 | \$280.66 | \$534.74 | \$1,155.69 | \$1,708,888 | \$1,883,002 | 110% | \$1,979,141 | 116% |
| Nov-16 | 3,785 | 1,176 | 17 | 4,978 | 1,095 | 1.22 | \$280.66 | \$534.74 | \$1,155.69 | \$1,710,799 | \$1,914,677 | 112% | \$1,977,014 | 116% |
| Dec-16 | 3,783 | 1,176 | 17 | 4,976 | 1,094 | 1.22 | \$280.66 | \$534.74 | \$1,155.69 | \$1,710,238 | \$2,060,513 | 120% | \$1,948,013 | 114% |
| Totals / Averages | | | | 4958 | | | | | | \$20,459,046 | \$23,067,667 | 113% | \$23,142,111 | 113% |
| Surplus | s / (Defic | it) | | | | | | | | | -\$2,608,621 | | -\$2,683,065 | |



City Plan (UHC)—Medicare Claims Experience

Observations

- During the year, <u>enrollment remained flat</u>
- The contract size remained steady at 1.22 throughout the year
- Average incurred cost per subscriber increased:
 - 2016: \$369 vs. average premium of 344 = incurred loss ratio of
 - 2015: \$325 vs. average premium of \$334 = incurred loss ratio of <u>97%</u>



City Plan (UHC)—Medicare Claims Experience

Observations (continued)

- Average paid cost per subscriber increased:
 - 2016: \$369 vs. average premium of 344 = paid loss ratio of 113%
 - 2015: \$325 vs. average premium of \$334 = paid loss ratio of <u>100%</u>
- Membership decreased (due to the NPPO offer to retirees):
 - December 2016: 4,976
 - December 2015: 5,569



Conclusion

Membership in 2016 has increased for both the active and early retiree pools and the average cost per member has decreased. This is a clear indication that the action taken by the HSB has brought about the desired results.

Conversely, membership in 2016 decreased in the Medicare PPO plan and the cost increased per member. Given the direction of the Medicare PPO plan, from a cost and membership basis, it was prudent to move these members to the fully-insured Medicare Advantage PPO in 2017. The Medicare Advantage Program has a favorable rating position and a second year rate cap.



Conclusion (continued)

The active member count in January 2017 increased from 891, in December 2016, to 981 and the E+2 members increased from 115, in December 2016, to 145. The early retiree members increased to 698 to 719. This indicates that the Buy Down for the 2017 rates was prudent and increased the membership base over which costs are spread particularly among families.

Finally, at May 11, 2017 HSB meeting, Aon will present the City Plan active and early retiree rates which will include claims experience through March 31, 2017.

