# SFHSS Risk Score Analysis 

Medical Risk Scores

- Risk Scores have been calculated utilizing the Verisk DxCG model in the Truven All Payer Claims Database (APCD). Risk scores are an actuarial tool used to predict health care costs based on the relative actuarial risk of enrollees. Verisk's DxCG model is a proprietary predictive model using age, gender and diagnoses
- In order to have scores available for the early part of the rates and benefit cycle and to have them calculated on a full year with runout, scores have been based on the period of October 2014 - September 2015 and October 2015 - September 2016
- Concurrent models use base period claims to predict expenditures in the same time period. Prospective models use base period claims to predict future expenditures
- The APCD utilizes all diagnoses available on the claim
- Consistent with what has been reported to the Health Service Board (HSB) in previous years, the scores presented are non-rescaled; that is to say based on the average of the nationwide dataset


## All Plans Risk Analysis - Overview

| All Plans - Overview |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Rolling Year | Population | BSC <br> Concurrent | BSC <br> Prospective | KP Concurrent | KP <br> Prospective | CP <br> Concurrent | CP Prospective | All Concurrent | All <br> Prospective |
| $\text { Sep, } 2016$ | Total | 1.24 | 1.25 | 1.03 | 1.09 | 2.60 | 2.39 | 1.130 | 1.173 |
|  | Actives | 1.092 | 1.120 | 0.925 | 0.987 | 1.797 | 1.709 | 1.005 | 1.051 |
|  | Early <br> Retirees | 2.181 | 2.170 | 1.900 | 2.043 | 3.108 | 2.990 | 2.124 | 2.176 |
| Oct, 2014 <br> Sep, 2015 | Total | 1.27 | 1.27 | 1.06 | 1.10 | 3.04 | 2.50 | 1.135 | 1.176 |
|  | Actives | 1.105 | 1.128 | 0.941 | 0.994 | 1.882 | 1.784 | 1.020 | 1.059 |
|  | Early Retirees | 2.106 | 2.123 | 1.970 | 2.067 | 3.297 | 2.907 | 2.128 | 2.153 |

> In June 2016, SFHSS reported risk scores for all of 2015 to the Health Service Board. Because these scores have been calculated on a rolling year through September, the 2015 risk score presented here have been recalculated
> Previously reported for PY2015: KP Concurrent Actives: . 943 KP Prospective Actives: .993, KP Concurrent ER: 1.930, KP Prospective ER 2.038, Total KP Concurrent: 1.073, Total KP Prospective: 1.106
> Previously reported for PY2015: BSC Concurrent Actives: 1.029 BSC Prospective Actives: 1.077, BSC Concurrent ER: 1.973, BSC Prospective ER 2.035, Total BSC Concurrent: 1.184, Total BSC Prospective: 1.213. The change in scores points to an impact from Q4 of 2014

## SAN FRANCISCO

## Kaiser Permanente Risk Scores by Gender/Age for Actives

| Kaiser Permanente |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Rolling Year | Gender/Age | Member Count | Avg Age | Avg Concurrent Risk Score | Avg Prospective Risk Score |
| Oct, 2015 - Sep, 2016 | ACTIVES |  |  |  |  |
| Female | <18 | 5,734 | 9.1 | 0.389 | 0.353 |
|  | 18-24 | 2,953 | 21.1 | 0.656 | 0.696 |
|  | 25-34 | 4,775 | 29.9 | 1.000 | 1.042 |
|  | 35-44 | 5,075 | 39.5 | 1.144 | 1.109 |
|  | 45-54 | 5,350 | 49.4 | 1.291 | 1.421 |
|  | 55-59 | 2,446 | 56.9 | 1.627 | 1.876 |
|  | 60-64 | 1,524 | 61.7 | 1.785 | 2.069 |
|  | 65 + | 142 | 65.0 | 2.788 | 2.410 |
|  | All Females* | 25,764 | 34.3 | 1.017 | 1.075 |
| Male | $<18$ | 5,991 | 8.9 | 0.425 | 0.370 |
|  | 18-24 | 3,066 | 21.0 | 0.405 | 0.354 |
|  | 25-34 | 3,869 | 29.8 | 0.455 | 0.459 |
|  | 35-44 | 4,376 | 39.7 | 0.759 | 0.762 |
|  | 45-54 | 5,209 | 49.5 | - 1.064 | 1.238 |
|  | 55-59 | 2,547 | 56.9 | 1.617 | 1.916 |
|  | 60-64 | 1,667 | 61.8 | 2.099 | 2.422 |
|  | 65 + | 164 | 65.0 | 2.408 | 2.636 |
|  | All Males* | 24,610 | 34.1 | 0.829 | 0.895 |
|  | All Active Lives* | 50,374 | 34.2 | . 925 | . 987 |

*These member counts are for unique members. Within the age bands and individual may be counted twice if they crossed age bands during the year. The risk score is weighted based on their member months within the age group.

## Kaiser Permanente Risk Scores by Gender/Age for Early Retirees

| Kaiser Permanente |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Rolling Year | Gender/Age | Member Count | Avg Age | Avg Concurrent Risk Score | Avg Prospective Risk Score |
| Oct, 2015 - Sep, 2016 |  | EARLY RETIREES |  |  |  |
| Female | <18 | 86 | 12.9 | 0.527 | 0.487 |
|  | 18-24 | 175 | 21.5 | 0.519 | 0.648 |
|  | 25-34 | 70 | 25.8 | 0.831 | 1.042 |
|  | 35-44 | 42 | 41.1 | 1.411 | 1.210 |
|  | 45-54 | 392 | 51.4 | 1.788 | - 1.871 |
|  | 55-59 | 716 | 57.3 | 1.609 | - 1.888 |
|  | 60-64 | 1,329 | 62.1 | 2.064 | 2.206 |
|  | $65+$ |  |  |  |  |
|  | All Females* | 2,545 | 54.3 | 1.733 | 1 1.890 |
| Male | <18 | 113 | 12.7 | 0.464 | 0.473 |
|  | 18-24 | 177 | 21.2 | 0.457 | 0.407 |
|  | 25-34 | 52 | 25.8 | 0.666 | - 0.604 |
|  | 35-44 | 18 | 42.2 | 1.561 | 1.510 |
|  | 45-54 | 209 | 51.5 | 2.401 | 2.011 |
|  | 55-59 | 552 | 57.3 | 1.850 | - 2.065 |
|  | 60-64 | 1,228 | 62.3 | 2.576 | - 2.783 |
|  | 65 + |  |  |  |  |
|  | All Males* | 2,177 | 54.2 | 2.097 | 2.223 |
|  | All Early Retiree Lives* | 4,722 | 54.2 | 1.900 | 2.043 |

*These member counts are for unique members. Within the age bands and individual may be counted twice if they crossed age bands during the year. The risk score is weighted based on their member months within the age group.

## Blue Shield Risk Scores by Gender/Age for Actives

| Blue Shield |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Rolling Year | Gender/Age | Member Count | Avg Age | Avg Concurrent Risk Score | Avg Prospective Risk Score |
| Oct, 2015 - Sep, 2016 | ACTIVES |  |  |  |  |
| Female | <18 | 3,991 | 9.2 | 0.452 | 0.410 |
|  | 18-24 | 1,916 | 21.0 | 0.655 | 0.664 |
|  | 25-34 | 2,193 | 30.1 | 0.981 | 1.060 |
|  | 35-44 | 3,419 | 39.8 | 1.154 | 1.165 |
|  | 45-54 | 4,359 | 49.6 | 1.438 | 1.499 |
|  | 55-59 | 2,286 | 57.0 | 1.845 | 1.939 |
|  | 60-64 | 1,528 | 61.7 | 1.984 | 2.137 |
|  | 65 + | 126 | 65.0 | 2.501 | 2.229 |
|  | All Females* | 18,110 | 36.3 | 1.146 | 1.182 |
| Male | $<18$ | 4,144 | 9.0 | 0.590 | 0.468 |
|  | 18-24 | 1,951 | 21.0 | 0.533 | 0.403 |
|  | 25-34 | 1,832 | 29.9 | 0.620 | 0.590 |
|  | 35-44 | 2,644 | 39.9 | 0.828 | 0.840 |
|  | 45-54 | 3,989 | 49.6 | 1.229 | 1.354 |
|  | 55-59 | 2,097 | 57.0 | 1.750 | 1.957 |
|  | 60-64 | 1,527 | 61.7 | 2.214 | 2.391 |
|  | 65 + | 139 | 65.0 | 3.099 | 2.882 |
|  | All Males* | 16,768 | 35.5 | 1.034 | 1.054 |
|  | All Active Lives* | 34,880 | 35.9 | 1.092 | 1.120 |

*These member counts are for unique members. Within the age bands and individual may be counted twice if they crossed age bands during the year. The risk score is weighted based on their member months within the age group.

## Blue Shield Risk Scores by Gender/Age for Early Retirees

| Blue Shield |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Rolling Year | Gender/Age | Member Count | Avg Age | Avg Concurrent Risk Score | Avg Prospective Risk Score |
| Oct, 2015 - Sep, 2016 |  | EARLY RETIREES |  |  |  |
| Female | < 18 | 136 | 13.1 | 1.822 | 1.131 |
|  | 18-24 | 235 | 21.6 | 0.737 | 0.748 |
|  | 25-34 | 80 | 25.7 | 2.602 | 1.694 |
|  | 35-44 | 38 | 40.7 | 1.033 | 1.145 |
|  | 45-54 | 351 | 51.4 | - 1.811 | 1.842 |
|  | 55-59 | 694 | 57.2 | 2.025 | 2.073 |
|  | 60-64 | 1,297 | 62.2 | 2.469 | 2.514 |
|  | 65 + |  |  | 0.000 | 0.000 |
|  | All Females* | 2,592 | 52.8 | 2.086 | 2.073 |
| Male | $<18$ | 112 | 12.7 | 0.490 | 0.439 |
|  | 18-24 | 255 | 21.5 | 0.602 | 0.484 |
|  | 25-34 | 72 | 25.6 | 0.908 | 0.557 |
|  | 35-44 | 11 | 40.8 | 2.597 | 2.569 |
|  | 45-54 | 174 | 51.5 | 3.479 | 2.895 |
|  | 55-59 | 534 | 57.3 | - 2.451 | 2.422 |
|  | 60-64 | 1,219 | 62.2 | 2.640 | 2.759 |
|  | 65 + |  |  | 0.000 | 0.000 |
|  | All Males* | 2,181 | 52.7 | 2.295 | 2.286 |
|  | All Early Retiree Lives* | 4,773 | 52.8 | 2.181 | 2.170 |

*These member counts are for unique members. Within the age bands and individual may be counted twice if they crossed age bands during the year. The risk score is weighted based on their member months within the age group.

City Plan Risk Scores by Gender/Age for Actives

| City Plan |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Rolling Year | Gender/Age | Member Count | Avg Age | Avg Concurrent Risk Score | Avg Prospective Risk Score |
| Oct, 2015 - Sep, 2016 | ACTIVES |  |  |  |  |
| Female | $<18$ | 83 | 9.1 | 0.502 | 0.408 |
|  | 18-24 | 54 | 21.6 | 0.918 | 0.790 |
|  | 25-34 | 115 | 30.3 | 1.376 | 1.590 |
|  | 35-44 | 123 | 39.7 | 1.502 | 1.319 |
|  | 45-54 | 157 | 50.1 | 2.415 | 2.332 |
|  | 55-59 | 97 | 57.1 | 4.043 | 3.238 |
|  | 60-64 | 71 | 61.9 | 2.735 | 2.759 |
|  | $65+$ | 12 | 65.0 | 3.609 | 2.617 |
|  | All Females* | 658 | 41.3 | 2.081 | 1.917 |
| Male | <18 | 100 | 8.6 | 0.522 | 0.435 |
|  | 18-24 | 51 | 21.5 | 0.868 | 0.662 |
|  | 25-34 | 109 | 30.1 | 0.985 | 0.777 |
|  | 35-44 | 135 | 39.3 | 0.848 | 0.916 |
|  | 45-54 | 196 | 49.8 | 1.640 | 1.662 |
|  | 55-59 | 128 | 57.2 | 2.424 | 2.579 |
|  | 60-64 | 74 | 61.8 | 3.544 | 3.307 |
|  | 65 + | 5 | 65.0 | 1.392 | 1.900 |
|  | All Males* | 737 | 41.6 | 1.557 | 1.532 |
|  | All Active Lives* | 1,395 | 41.4 | 1.797 | 1.709 |

*These member counts are for unique members. Within the age bands and individual may be counted twice if they crossed age bands during the year. The risk score is weighted based on their member months within the age group.

City Plan Risk Scores by Gender/Age for Early Retirees
City Plan

| Rolling Year | Gender/Age | Member Count | Avg Age | Avg Concurrent Risk Score | Avg Prospective Risk Score |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Oct, 2015 - Sep, 2016 |  | EARLY RETIREES |  |  |  |
| Female | <18 | 10 | 11.3 | 4.479 | 3.442 |
|  | 18-24 | 15 | 21.8 | 3.561 | 2.615 |
|  | 25-34 | 3 | 25.9 | 1.723 | 2.184 |
|  | 35-44 | 3 | 39.8 | 1.673 | 1.451 |
|  | 45-54 | 65 | 51.3 | 1.938 | 1.972 |
|  | 55-59 | 114 | 57.3 | 2.438 | 2.477 |
|  | 60-64 | 312 | 62.2 | 3.537 | 3.086 |
|  | 65 + |  |  | 0.000 | 0.000 |
|  | All Females* | 488 | 57.9 | 3.091 | 2.795 |
| Male | <18 | 12 | 12.2 | 0.815 | 0.613 |
|  | 18-24 | 12 | 20.2 | 0.512 | 0.464 |
|  | 25-34 | 4 | 25.0 | 0.681 | 0.581 |
|  | 35-44 | 3 | 41.7 | 0.230 | 0.459 |
|  | 45-54 | 43 | 52.4 | 3.737 | 4.046 |
|  | 55-59 | 119 | 57.4 | 3.219 | 3.175 |
|  | 60-64 | 254 | 62.3 | 3.273 | 3.432 |
|  | 65 + |  |  | 0.000 | 0.000 |
|  | All Males* | 409 | 57.4 | 3.129 | 3.230 |
|  | All Early Retiree Lives* | 897 | 57.7 | 3.108 | 2.990 |

*These member counts are for unique members. Within the age bands and individual may be counted twice if they crossed age bands during the year. The risk score is weighted based on their member months within the age group.

## All Plans Combined - Active Lives by Relationship

| All Plans - Active \& Dependents |  |  |  |
| :--- | ---: | :--- | :--- |
| Avg <br> Rolling Year | Concurrent <br> Risk Score | Avg Prospective <br> Risk Score |  |
| Oct, 2015 - Sep, 2016 | 85,444 | 1.005 | 1.051 |
| Employees | 41,231 | 1.242 | 1.338 |
| Spouses | 15,473 | 1.317 | 1.403 |
| Children | 28,740 | 0.492 | 0.444 |
| Oct, 2014 - Sep, 2015 | 83,079 | 1.020 | 1.059 |
| Employees | 39,785 | 1.284 | 1.362 |
| Spouses | 15,136 | 1.313 | 1.391 |
| Children |  | 28,158 | 0.483 |

- The presentation of age bands by health plan for actives totals 86,649 lives.
- Due to the rolling year presentation which crosses plan years, 85,444 reflects total unique lives
- Within the active population, the risk scores for the spouse/domestic partners are higher than the employees


## All Plans Combined - Early Retiree Lives by Relationship

| All Plans - Early Retirees \& Dependents |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Rolling Year | Population | Avg Concurrent Risk Score | Avg Prospective Risk Score |
| Oct, 2015 - Sep, 2016 | 10,126 | 2.124 | 2.176 |
| Early Retiree | 6,697 | 2.434 | 2.511 |
| Spouses | 2,006 | 1.972 | 2.064 |
| Children | 1,423 | 0.829 | 0.697 |
| Oct, 2014 - Sep, 2015 | 10,237 | 2.128 | 2.153 |
| Early Retiree | 6,788 | 2.410 | 2.474 |
| Spouses | 1,983 | 2.132 | 2.104 |
| Children | 1,466 | 0.745 | 0.650 |

- The presentation of age bands by health plan for early retirees totals 10,392 lives.
- Due to the rolling year presentation which crosses plan years, 10,126 reflects total unique lives
- Within the early retiree population the risk score for the spouse/domestic partners is lower than the early retiree which may be a result of the disability retirements


## Benchmarks - All Plans comparison - Allowed Amount PMPM

| Actives \& Early Retirees |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Rolling Year | Population | Members Avg Med or Rx | Relative Risk Score Concurrent | Allow Amt PMPM Med and Rx | Dyn Adj Allow Amt PMPM Med and Rx | Ratio Dyn <br> Adj Allow <br> Amt PMPM <br> Med and Rx |
| Oct, 2015 - Sep, 2016 | TOTAL | 86,929 | 1.15 | \$517.09 | \$517.44 | 1.0 |
|  | Blue Shield | 35,985 | 1.242 | \$652.41 | \$558.51 | 1.17 |
|  | City Plan | 1,817 | 2.604 | \$1,320.21 | \$1,171.03 | 1.13 |
|  | Kaiser | 49,128 | 1.031 | \$388.25 | \$463.20 | 0.84 |

> Blue Shield Medical and RX PMPM allowed amounts were $17 \%$ higher when adjusted based on age/gender and diagnoses. Blue Shield is the least efficient of the three plans in this area
> City Plan Medical and RX PMPM allowed amounts were 13\% higher when adjusted based on age/gender and diagnoses
> Kaiser Permanente Medical and RX PMPM allowed amounts were $16 \%$ lower when adjusted based on age/gender and diagnoses
$>$ This report uses the average number of members per month with medical enrollment which differs from the unique count of members found in other pages of this report

## Conclusion

- Prospective Risk scores experienced a slight improvement with the addition of younger lives to the risk pool
- Across all plans, the male population for the early retirees has a higher risk score than the female population
- Across all plans the female population for active employees has a higher risk score than the male population
- Blue Shield's Allowed Amount Med and RX PMPM was more costly when adjusting for age/sex and diagnosis and the least efficient of the three plans

